Cautious Citizenship: How immigration enforcement is deterrent, deteriorative, and deleterious in health care politics

Francisco I. Pedraza

October 29, 2018
Cautious Citizenship: How immigration enforcement is deterrent, deteriorative, and deleterious in health care politics

Francisco I. Pedraza

October 29, 2018
Help me get Latinos enrolled
Mr. President,
many Latinos are nervous about enrolling...
“Don’t be afraid”

Funding 2000-16: $7 billion → $19 billion.
Ports of entry → interior operations

U.S. deportations
A U.S. district judge issued a court order last week to halt President Obama’s executive action on immigration, which would grant temporary relief from deportation for millions of people who are in the U.S. illegally.

TOTAL DEPORTATIONS
Thousands of people by fiscal year

Source: U.S. Department of Homeland Security
“...we are getting them out of our country or we are going to incarcerate.”

-Nov 13, 2016 on 60 Minutes
Enforcement expansion

- Funding 2016-18: Increase for Customs and Border Patrol by 22%
- Customs and Border Patrol to hire 5,000 new agents
- Immigration and Customs Enforcement to hire 2,000 new agents
- Immigration arrests up 30% in 2017

“…we are getting them out of our country or we are going to incarcerate.”
-Nov 13, 2016 on 60 Minutes
Enforcement expansion

- Muslim ban
- Military response to refugees
- Targeting legal permanent residents
- Public charge
- End birthright citizenship
- Family separation

“...we are getting them out of our country or we are going to incarcerate.”

- Nov 13, 2016 on 60 Minutes
In what way is immigration politics spilling over to health care matters?

- access and use resources?
- view towards officials and health care providers?
- harming people?
In what way is immigration politics spilling over to health care matters?

- deters access and use
- deteriorates trust
- deleterious to health
Cautious Citizenship

A type of civic engagement in which individuals consider the costs, benefits, and risks associated with fully exercising their right to interact in daily life, including with service providing bureaucracies and democratic institutions.
Immigration enforcement targets service bureaucracies.

Immigrant arrested by ICE after dropping daughter off at school, sending shockwaves through neighborhood

Advocates say ICE courthouse arrests in N.J. are hurting immigrant crime victims

Immigrant mother arrested at gynecologist's office draws national attention

Activists fear immigrants won't seek care

'Mom, Where Are You?' Girl With Cerebral Palsy Detained by Immigration Officials Cries for Help
Deputized enforcers and bureaucrats in cahoots.

The story of Blanca Borrego...

Immigrant mother arrested at gynecologist's office draws national attention

Activists fear immigrants won't seek care
Immigration enforcement provokes risk assessment.

Immigrants are going hungry so Trump won’t deport them

By Ike Swetlitz @ikesweetlitz
February 24, 2017

Fearing Deportation, Many Immigrants Are Avoiding Police And Courts

By: Ben Schamisso
Posted: 1:48 PM, Jun 12, 2018

Immigrants, fearing Trump’s deportation policies, avoid doctor visits

AFTER AN IMMIGRATION RAID, A CITY’S STUDENTS VANISH
Immigration enforcement gets under the skin.

Report: Immigration enforcement has students fearful and depressed

Schools are not safe from the fallout generated by the Trump administration's immigration enforcement, a UCLA survey finds.

How Crackdowns on Immigrants Leave a Psychological Toll

by Anna Núñez on February 20, 2018

Newsweek

U.S.

TRUMP'S IMMIGRATION CRACKDOWN CREATING A PUBLIC HEALTH CRISIS AMONG CHILDREN, ANALYSTS SAY

BY NICOLE RODRIGUEZ ON 1/4/18 AT 11:02 AM
What we know...

Restrictive immigration policy...

- “chills” program participation and use of resources
- deportation raids and feeling hunted; stressor “weathers” health

Critiques:

- Less known about role of local police interior operations
- Less theory or evidence of how policy effects are internalized
Policy feedback connects to mass behavior via...

- material effects of policy: resource distribution
- interpretive effects: attitudes about self and government
- **psychological and physical distress**
Immigration enforcement and restrictive immigration policy is pervasive and chronically salient for Latinos

- 40% Latino adults foreign-born, 85% all Latinos have one immigrant grandparent
- Gallup 1994–2016: 2-19% general public (mostly whites) say immigration most important problem
- Pew Hispanic Center 2007-2014: 27–37% Latinos say immigration most important problem
- since 2010 96% of all deportations Latin Americans
- Latino Decision registered voter polls consistent 2011–2016 35–40% know someone who is undocumented
Immigration enforcement and restrictive immigration policy is pervasive, personal, and chronically salient for Latinos

- Interpretive effects via saliency and social networks: Latinos learn to be cautious citizens
- Avoidance of resources means interpretive effects translate into material effects
- Policy as a stressor

Restrictive immigration policies

- deterrent of service and program use
- deteriorate trust in service-providing bureaucracies
- deleterious to well-being
Restrictive immigration policies should...

deter service use:
  - experimental prime reveals balance of considerations

deteriorate trust:
  - Intensity of local immigration enforcement increases skepticism about security of personal information shared with doctors

deleterious of health:
  - Intensity of local immigration enforcement increases need for mental health services
How Immigration Policy Impacts Health Equity

Cautious Citizenship: The Deterring Effect of Immigration Issue Salience on Health Care Use and Bureaucratic Interactions among Latino US Citizens

Francisco I. Pedraza
University of California, Riverside

Vanessa Cruz Nichols
University of Michigan

Alana M. W. LeBrón
University of California, Irvine
Thinking ahead to next year, with all the public attention to [Treatment]...

- CONTROL, no prime:
- health care issues: PSA on enrollment
- immigration issues: welcoming OR unwelcoming
Thinking ahead to next year, with all the public attention to [Treatment]…

- CONTROL, no prime:
- health care issues: PSA on enrollment
- immigration issues: welcoming OR unwelcoming

how likely are you to make an appointment to see a doctor or a nurse, or go to a clinic for health care services?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Sample in Experiment</th>
<th>Moderator Value 1</th>
<th>Moderator Value 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health insurance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immigration issues</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=463</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=459</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=440</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Likelihood of Making an Appointment to See a Health Care Provider?**

*(Response by Exposure to Issue Cue)*

**Average Deterrence:** −8 points
Likelihood of Making an Appointment to See a Health Care Provider? (Response by Exposure to Issue Cue)

- **No Prime (Control)**
  - Total Sample in Experiment: 463
  - Does NOT Know Undocumented: 440
  - Does Know Undocumented: 270

- **Health insurance**
  - Total Sample in Experiment: 459
  - Does NOT Know Undocumented: 256
  - Does Know Undocumented: 256

- **Immigration issues**
  - Total Sample in Experiment: 440
  - Does NOT Know Undocumented: 248
  - Does Know Undocumented: 193

- **Proportion**
  - Proportions range from 0 to 60
Does “immigration issues” deter use of services?

Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens
Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship status?
Does “immigration issues” deter use of services?

Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens
Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship status?

1. Talking with police or reporting crimes (16%)
Does “immigration issues” deter use of services?

Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens
Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship status?

1. Talking with police or reporting crimes (16%)
2. Driving a car (14%)
Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens
Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship status?

1. **Talking with police or reporting crimes (16%)**
2. Driving a car (14%)
3. Renewing or applying for a drivers license (14%)
Does “immigration issues” deter use of services?

Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens. Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship status?

1. **Talking with police or reporting crimes (16%)**
2. Driving a car (14%)
3. Renewing or applying for a drivers license (14%)
4. Dropping off or picking up from airport (14%)
Does “immigration issues” deter use of services?

Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens
Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship status?

1. **Talking with police or reporting crimes (16%)**
2. Driving a car (14%)
3. Renewing or applying for a drivers license (14%)
4. Dropping off or picking up from airport (14%)
5. **Visiting a doctor or clinic (13%)**
Study 1

Does “immigration issues” deter use of services?

Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens
Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you
don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship
status?

1. **Talking with police or reporting crimes (16%)**
2. Driving a car (14%)
3. Renewing or applying for a drivers license (14%)
4. Dropping off or picking up from airport (14%)
5. **Visiting a doctor or clinic (13%)**
6. Using public transportation like buses (13%)
Does “immigration issues” deter use of services?

Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens
Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship status?

1. Talking with police or reporting crimes (16%)
2. Driving a car (14%)
3. Renewing or applying for a drivers license (14%)
4. Dropping off or picking up from airport (14%)
5. Visiting a doctor or clinic (13%)
6. Using public transportation like buses (13%)
7. Talking with educators (11%)
Does “immigration issues” deter use of services?

Evidence from 2015 survey experiment of Latino citizens
Please tell me if you avoid this type of activity because you don’t want to be bothered or asked about your citizenship status?

1. **Talking with police or reporting crimes (16%)**
2. Driving a car (14%)
3. Renewing or applying for a drivers license (14%)
4. Dropping off or picking up from airport (14%)
5. **Visiting a doctor or clinic (13%)**
6. Using public transportation like buses (13%)
7. **Talking with educators (11%)**
Proportion avoiding daily-life activities (responses by exposure to issue cue)

Average Health

0 5 10 15 20 25

airport  dmv  car  bus  school  clinic  police

Proportion Reticent —>
Study 1

Proportion avoiding daily-life activities (responses by exposure to issue cue)

Proportion Reticent —>

0 5 10 15 20 25

Average Health

Proportion Reticent —>

Airport dmv car bus school clinic police
Proportion avoiding daily-life activities
(responses by exposure to issue cue)

Average Immigration

Average Health

airport  dmv  car  bus  school  clinic  police

Proportion Reticent ->

0  5  10  15  20  25

Average Health

Average Immigration
Study 1

Proportion avoiding daily-life activities
(responses by exposure to issue cue)

Average Health

Average Immigration

Average Avoidance: +5 points
Proportion avoiding daily–life activities
(responses by exposure to issue cue)

- Health insurance: n=454
- Immigration issues: n=514

Average Deterrence: ~5.2 points

Proportion Avoiding Activity

Health insurance: 10.8, 12.5, 13.7
Immigration issues: 14.0, 18.3, 21.2

Total Sample
Proportion avoiding daily–life activities
(responses by exposure to issue cue)

School
Clinic
Police

Health insurance
Immigration issues

Proportion Avoiding Activity

Total Sample
Does NOT Know
Undocumented

Does Know
Undocumented

School
Clinic
Police

Proportion Avoiding Activity

n=514
n=514
n=191
n=215
n=240
n=317
n=454
Proportion avoiding daily-life activities (responses by exposure to issue cue)

- Health insurance
- Immigration issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Sample</th>
<th>State Policy Perceived Welcoming</th>
<th>State Policy Perceived Unwelcoming</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>n=454</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=514</td>
<td>13.9, 18.2</td>
<td>21.1, 25.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=291</td>
<td>10.7, 15.4</td>
<td>12.1, 13.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=165</td>
<td>14.0, 21.1</td>
<td>17.9, 19.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=339</td>
<td>13.9, 19.0</td>
<td>12.5, 18.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n=175</td>
<td>12.5, 18.2</td>
<td>18.2, 25.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health insurance</th>
<th>Immigration issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.7, 15.4</td>
<td>12.1, 13.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.0, 21.1</td>
<td>17.9, 19.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.9, 18.2</td>
<td>12.5, 18.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.9, 18.2</td>
<td>18.2, 25.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Implication of avoidance

There are 47 million Latino citizens in America

- If 13% of Latino citizens in US “avoid” health care providers...
- and if $200 is average cost of wellness visit for uninsured...
- and if $1,233 is average cost of ER visit for uninsured...
- then $6.3 billion is high end of cost of immigration enforcement
Pressure Latinos feel to practice cautious citizenship varies because degree to which authorities target “Low Priority” immigrants varies across locales.

Vanessa Cruz Nichols
Indiana University

Alana M. W. LeBrón
University of California, Irvine

Francisco I. Pedraza
University of California, Riverside

Research Article
Spillover Effects: Immigrant Policing and Government Skepticism in Matters of Health for Latinos
SComm reduces trust in government as a source of health information … but only for Latinos, and no link to other sources of health info. (HINTS 2012)
SComm reduces trust in government as a source of health information ... but only for Latinos, and no link to other sources of health info. (HINTS 2012)
Study 2

Implication of distrust in government

When CDC issues PSA for seasonal influenza or other outbreaks like zika...

- Undermines information transmission
- Costs kicked down road likely to increase
Is immigration enforcement intensity deteriorative of trust?

2015 LNHIS, n=1,490, Jan/Feb 2015

Which statement do you agree with most about personal information shared with doctors?

Is Safe & Secure: 73%

Is Shared, not Secure: 26
Secure Communities is a controversial federal program that sends booking information from local jails to a joint database shared by the FBI and the Immigration and Customs Enforcement Agency (ICE). Since 2008, Congress has spent millions for the program to target "dangerous criminal aliens."

Deportations are at a record high, but most of those removed are innocent or low-level offenders who have served their time.

**HOW IT WORKS**

1. **POLICE ARREST A PERSON.**
2. **POLICE SCAN THE PERSON'S PRINTS & SUBMIT THEM TO BE CHECKED AGAINST FBI & ICE RECORDS.**
3. **IF ICE AGENTS FIND A MATCH THEY CAN ASK POLICE TO DETAIN THE PERSON UNTIL THEY CAN PICK THEM UP.**
4. **POLICE CAN RELEASE THE PERSON OR DETAIN THEM FOR UP TO 48 HOURS.**
County-level intensity of immigration enforcement

Secure Communities Deportations per 1,000 Hispanics, as of December 2014
County-level intensity of immigration enforcement

National Average: 7.2 per 1,000
  - Oakland, CA
25th percentile: 2.9 per 1,000
  - Miami, FL
75th percentile: 9.8 per 1,000
  - Denton, TX
15% live where less than 1 in 1,000 deportations
  - Cook County, IL

50% live where 6+ deportations per 1,000
1 respondent lives in Twiggs County, GA: 40+ per 1,000
Deportations and security of personal information

Logit estimates:
95% confidence interval is shaded

Pr(Believes information is NOT secure)

County-level deportations per 1,000 Hispanics
Is immigration enforcement intensity deleterious to health?

2015 LNHIS, n=1,490, Jan/Feb 2015

In the past 12 months did you think you needed help for emotional or mental health problems, such as feeling sad, anxious, or nervous?

No: 76%

Yes: 24
Deportations and mental health

Logit estimates:
95% confidence interval is shaded

Pr(Needed help for mental health in past year)

Knows someone deported

Does not know someone deported

County-level deportations per 1,000 Hispanics
Key Point 1

Immigration enforcement changes the calculus of engagement for Latinos and creates incentive to practice cautious citizenship.

1. deteriorates trust
2. deters engagement
3. deleterious to health
Immigration policy = health policy

- Vulnerabilities are rooted in public policy
- Policy effects spills over to non-policy targets
- Quintessential definition of politics: “Who gets what?”
- Deep irony: Latinos help reduce health cost, but ICE may create inefficiencies for law enforcement, but introduces new costs in health care provision
Thank you!

CHAS and Angela Garcia
Keith Brown
But wait, there’s more...
Likelihood of Making an Appointment to See a Health Care Provider? (Response by Exposure to Issue Cue)

- **No Prime (Control)**
  - Pre-Election: n=463, Post-Election: n=459
  - Total Sample in Experiment: n=440

- **Health insurance**
  - Pre-Election: n=322, Post-Election: n=320
  - Total Sample in Experiment: n=304

- **Immigration issues**
  - Pre-Election: n=141, Post-Election: n=139
  - Total Sample in Experiment: n=136
Pre- and Post-Election Experiment
Which statement do you agree with most about personal information shared with doctors?

Table: Attitudes about sharing personal information with doctors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Pre All</th>
<th>Post All</th>
<th>Pre Dark Skin</th>
<th>Post Dark Skin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Is safe &amp; Secure</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Pre- and Post-Election Experiment
Which statement do you agree with most about personal information shared with doctors?

Table: Attitudes about sharing personal information with doctors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Pre All</th>
<th>Post All</th>
<th>Pre Dark Skin</th>
<th>Post Dark Skin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Is safe &amp; Secure</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is Shared, not Secure</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Deportations and self-reported use Western Union

Logit estimates: 95% confidence interval is shaded
Deportations and self-reported use of health insurance

Logit estimates:
95% confidence interval is shaded
Deportations and self-reported use health insurance

Logit estimates:
95% confidence interval is shaded

Low Priority deportations per 1,000 Hispanics

Deportations and self-reported health insurance

Logit estimates:
95% confidence interval is shaded

Total deportations per 1,000 Hispanics